



# Guide to Reviewers

*E-mail:* ijpp@ucc.ie  
*Phone:* +353-21-4903238/4902009  
*Fax:* +353-21-4903135  
*Homepage:* <http://ijpp.ucc.ie/>

---

## Guidance Notes for Reviewers for the IJPP

### *GENERAL COMMENTS ON ASSESSMENTS*

1. Minor editing of the script (where necessary) by the referee is encouraged. Please use tracking tools to show where changes have been made.
2. The form is for the author and will be sent with a covering letter from the Editor. If you reject, indicate why, briefly. Give some indication of strengths/weaknesses.
3. If you think it might be worth further consideration, indicate how the paper might be improved.
4. If you wish to make confidential comments about the article to the editor, please would you do so as a separate message/separate sheet.

### *SOME GENERAL POINTS*

It is important for the Editorial Board and the authors that reviewers offer enough comments to the authors to adequately support their recommended decision. Sometimes reviewers describe 'fatal flaws' in their comments to the Editorial Board that are not mentioned in comments to the author. If you have serious concerns that you do not wish to state, or state so strongly, to authors, please convey such comments to the Editor.

1. It is important that reviewers tell the author if they believe they are not been able to adequately review aspects of the manuscript and to suggest what other expertise would be necessary
2. Try to separate your assessments of technical quality and importance (i.e. whether the paper is of adequate standard or whether it deserves space in the journal).
3. Try to separate your assessment of quality from the paper's ideological or research perspective (i.e. does it address the 'right' question?)
4. If you believe that you know the author(s) of the paper, please let us know and if you believe that this will affect your critiques please let us know and do not review the manuscript.
5. Please note that the reviewers' comments will be sent to the authors in the form you provide (except where the Editorial Board makes an exception).
6. Please express your comments as if you were advising a valued colleague who knows who you are.

## *GUIDELINES FOR AUTHORS*

Has author followed the IJPP's Guidelines for Authors:

<http://www.ucc.ie/en/government/IrishJournalofPublicPolicy/GuidelinesforAuthors/>

### *Scholarship*

1. Is the work scholarly and original and can the language be understood by an international readership?
2. Does it have a sound scientific, philosophical or theoretical basis?
3. Is the literature review adequate and appropriate?
4. Is the material logical and well developed?
5. Are the conclusions logically derived?
6. Are any of the Tables/Figures superfluous or confusing?

### *Research Quality*

1. Are the research methods appropriate/adequate?
2. Does this paper answer a question that was worth asking?
3. Is the paper interesting to potential readers of IJPP?
4. Is this study a piece of primary research/a review article?

### *Referencing*

1. Have all references cited in the article been mentioned in the reference list?
2. Do reference spellings (and dates) in the article concur with those in the reference list?
3. Is the **reference list** complete? All surnames and initials (no et al) identified?
4. Do the authors use the IJPP (Harvard) style referencing system?

### *Other Points*

1. Have the full titles of institutions, organizations, etc. been identified in full, at least once in the article where abbreviations are used?
2. Have all Tables/Figures been labeled correctly?
3. Does the English require attention? Not too much jargon?
4. Is the paper unnecessarily long?
5. Does the author cite too much of her/his own earlier work?
6. Is there any indication of plagiarism?
7. Is there any copyright infringement, i.e. are sources correctly referred and do any non-original figures and tables have permissions attached?

Séamus Ó Tuama

For the Editorial Board, Irish Journal of Public Policy

July 2009

---

We wish to thank the *International Journal of Consumer Studies* from whose guidelines we developed this document.